

Dennis Dowling,  
Chair  
Justice Court  
Yavapai County

Matt Giordano, Vice  
Chair  
AZPOST

Christine Shipley,  
Secretary  
Multihousing  
Association

Valerie Beckett  
County Administrator  
Maricopa County



STATE OF ARIZONA

## CONSTABLE ETHICS, STANDARDS AND TRAINING BOARD

PO Box 13116 Phoenix, AZ 85002

cestb.az.gov

cestb@azcapitolconsulting.com

602-343-6280

FAX 602-712-1252

Scott Blake,  
Constable  
Maricopa County

Michael Hoggard  
Constable  
Mohave County

Melissa Buckley  
Public Member

### Minutes of Public Meeting – March 10, 2022

A public meeting of the Constables Ethics, Standards and Training Board (CESTB) was convened on March 10, 2022 at 9:01 a.m. at the offices of Capitol Consulting 818 N. 1<sup>st</sup> St, Phoenix, AZ 85004. CESTB Board members attending in person: Chairman Dennis Dowling and Vice Chair Matt Giordano. CESTB Board members attending via teleconference: Constable Scott Blake, Constable Michael Hoggard, and Valerie Beckett. Members absent: Secretary Christine Shipley and Melissa Buckley. The following staff was present – Tracy Unmacht. Members of the public attending in person: None. Members of the public attending via teleconference: Patrice Goodman, Scott Davis, Constable Nathan Wallace, Constable Mike Branham, Constable Bennett Bernal, Constable George Camacho.

A quorum was reached, and the following matters were discussed and decided at the meeting:

**Announcements:** Chairman Dowling announced the appointment of a new constable in Maricopa County, Bridget Bellavigna. He also reported attendance to a meeting to discuss the migration of the CESTB website, and planned attendance to DEMA meetings for the COOP plan.

#### **Minutes of Previous Meetings:**

Vice Chair Giordano made a motion to approve the minutes as presented from the February 10, 2022 CESTB meeting, and Constable Hoggard seconded. The motion passed 4-0 with Chairman Dowling abstaining.

**Financial Report:** Staff reviewed the January financial report received from Central Services Bureau. Constable Hoggard made a motion to accept the report and Constable Blake seconded. The motion passed 4-0 with Chairman Dowling abstaining.

**Call to the Public:** Constable Mike Branham stated that Maricopa County is implementing a mediation program to mitigate internal situations that might otherwise lead to complaints submitted to the CESTB. Patrice Goodman added Maricopa County Human Resources is putting in place a non-biased mediator.

#### **Presentation, Discussion & Possible Action on Organizational Training Grants – Chairman Dowling**

There were no applications submitted for this grant cycle.

#### **Presentation, discussion and possible action on review of current rules and procedures – Vice Chair Giordano**

Giordano has reviewed CESTB rules, statutes, Canons and internal administrative procedures and reported we are operating well within our rules and regulations. Vice Chair Giordano discussed the initial complaint screening process and recommended it be compacted and action directed out of the documents received from the complainant. He also discussed the potential implementation of a subcommittee or a designated person to flesh out questions and obtain any needed additional information prior to the meeting at which the complaint will be mitigated. Vice Chair Giordano will review further and provide a recommendation at the next meeting.

#### **Constable Complaints:**

CNA283-2022 Camacho – Clarification was made that the complainant (Napier) filed the complaint on behalf of former Pima County Constable Joe Ferguson. Evidence reviewed by Board members included the complaint, the constable

response and the criminal investigative reports conducted on the scene at the time of the incident cited in the complaint. The criminal investigation reported there were no independent witnesses to corroborate the complainant's allegations. Vice Chair Giordano concluded there were no violations of the AZ Administrative Code or the Constable Canons and made a motion to dismiss the complaint. Constable Hoggard seconded. Chairman Dowling also pointed out that an injunction against harassment was filed by Constable Camacho that was served upon former Constable Ferguson. It is an active injunction and Ferguson had the choice to challenge if he felt the allegations were not true, and he chose not to. The motion passed 4-0 with Chairman Dowling abstaining.

**Initial Screening of new Constable Complaints:**

Complaint received 08-08-2022 Lathan v Constable Mike Branham – Constable Blake requested the complaint investigation be moved forward. Per rules, when one board member requests investigation, the complaint must move forward. The motion passed 3-0 with Valerie Beckett and Chairman Dowling abstaining.

**Administrative Update:**

All training certificates have been recorded.

Staff reported the website migration is currently underway and should be completed in the next several weeks. Staff attended a training session and will attend 2 additional upcoming meetings/training sessions. Once the migration has been completed, staff will be reviewing the site to make sure everything was migrated correctly. Vice Chair Giordano requested staff look into improvements with our online complaint submission form.

Staff completed the 10 internal process surveys required by the Department of Administration.

**Future Agenda and Action Items:**

None

**Adjournment:** Vice Chair Giordano made a motion to adjourn the meeting and Constable Hoggard seconded. The motion passed unanimously 5-0. Meeting was adjourned at 9:34 a.m.

Dated this 19 day of April, 2022  
Constable Ethics, Standards and Training Board

By The Hon. Dennis Dowling



CESTB Chairman