

Dennis Dowling,
Chair
Justice Court
Yavapai County

Matt Giordano, Vice
Chair
AZPOST

Christine Shipley,
Secretary
Multihousing
Association

Valerie Beckett
County Administrator
Maricopa County



STATE OF ARIZONA

CONSTABLE ETHICS, STANDARDS AND TRAINING BOARD

PO Box 13116 Phoenix, AZ 85002
cestb.az.gov

cestb@azcapitolconsulting.com
602-343-6280
FAX 602-712-1252

Scott Blake,
Constable
Maricopa County

Michael Hoggard
Constable
Mohave County

Melissa Buckley
Public Member

Minutes of Public Meeting – May 12, 2022

A public meeting of the Constables Ethics, Standards and Training Board (CESTB) was convened on May 12, 2022 at 9:02 a.m. at the offices of Capitol Consulting 818 N. 1st St, Phoenix, AZ 85004. CESTB Board members attending in person: Chairman Dennis Dowling and. CESTB Board members attending via teleconference: Vice Chair Matt Giordano, Secretary Christine Shipley, Constable Scott Blake, Constable Michael Hoggard, Melissa Buckley and Valerie Beckett. Members absent: None. The following staff was present – Tracy Unmacht. Members of the public attending in person: Constable Mike Branham. Members of the public attending via teleconference: Patrice Goodman, Scott Davis, Constable Doug Clark, Constable Michael Stevenson, Constable Suzanne Smith, Pilar Ruiz, Mark Napier.

A quorum was reached, and the following matters were discussed and decided at the meeting:

The Chairman announced the removal of Item H from the agenda and stated any budgetary items related to it will be discussed during Item F.

Announcements: Chairman Dowling
None.

Minutes of Previous Meetings:

Corrections: None

Valerie Beckett made a motion to approve the minutes as presented from the April 14, 2022, CESTB meeting, and Melissa Buckley seconded. The motion passed 6-0 with Chairman Dowling abstaining.

Financial Report: Staff reviewed the March financial report received from Central Services Bureau. The board unanimously accepted the financial report.

Call to the Public:

No comments were made.

Presentation & Discussion Draft FY23 Budget – Chairman Dowling

Board members were provided with an update draft FY23 budget. Chairman Dowling suggested updating the annual budget amount for investigations to \$10,000 and board members concurred. A final budget will be submitted to the Board for approval at the June meeting.

Presentation, discussion and possible action on training grant application – Chairman Dowling

One application was received from the AZ Constables Association for Organizational Training requesting total funding in the amount of \$124,748.46. The event is currently scheduled to take place in August in Flagstaff to provide required continuing education to all constables and deputy constables. Funds available for this cycle are \$125,000. Board members submitted their scores for the record.

Melissa Buckley asked for clarification on printing expenses for presentations and suggested making pdf copies available to attendees. Constable Blake clarified that the expense is in the budget, however, if the expense is not incurred, it is not included in funds paid through the grant. The grant was approved unanimously 5-0-1 with Chairman Blake abstaining.

Melissa Buckley commented about the grant being received late and Vice Chair Giordano pointed out there were several small administrative errors in the application that should be cleaned up in the future.

Constable Complaints:

CNA289-2022 Branham – The complaint made by Constable Lathan and Constable Branham’s response were provided to the Board prior to the meeting for review. Constable Hoggard expressed his belief that Constable Branham was acting appropriately in trying to assist with an internal personnel issue and did not violate any Constable Canons or Ethics. Constable Hoggard made a motion to dismiss the complaint and Melissa Buckley seconded. Discussion – Christine Shipley pointed out that findings provided to the Board showed Constable Lathan’s actions continue to be contrary to proper workplace environment. The motion passed 6-0 with Chairman Dowling abstaining.

Initial Screening of new Constable Complaints:

Complaint received 05-03-22 Andre Simmons v Constable Nathan Wallace –Chairman Dowling asked if any board members wished to move forward with an investigation. No board members wished to move it forward, consequently the complaint was dismissed.

Complaint received 05-04-22 Pima County v Deborah Martinez – Constable Hoggard made a motion to move the complaint forward, Christine Shipley seconded. Chairman Dowling reminded the board it only takes one board member requesting to move a complaint forward, however requested a roll call vote for this motion. The motion passed 6-0 with Chairman Dowling abstaining. Notice will be sent to the constable, she will have 45 days to respond, and the complaint will be reviewed at the July board meeting.

Complaint received 05-06-22 Pilar Ruiz v Deborah Martinez – Christine Shipley requested to move the complaint forward. The Chairman requested a roll call vote and the request passed with a roll call vote 6-0 with Chairman Dowling abstaining. Notice will be sent to the constable, she will have 45 days to respond, and the complaint will be reviewed at the July board meeting.

Administrative Update:

Staff will be coordinating fiscal year closing activities with Central Services Bureau.

Staff will also begin compiling required information for budget and planning submissions which will be due the first part of September. Software downloads for the submissions is usually made available by June or July.

Staff is also following up on any pending grants.

Future Agenda and Action Items:

Chairman Dowling indicated he will be discussing HB2462 with the attorney general’s office and will report at the next meeting.

Adjournment: Christine Shipley made a motion to adjourn the meeting and Constable Hoggard seconded. The motion passed unanimously. Meeting was adjourned at 9:30 a.m.

Dated this 9 day of June, 2022
Constable Ethics, Standards and Training Board

By Dennis Dowling



CESTB Chairman