

Dennis Dowling,  
Chair  
Justice Court  
Yavapai County

Matt Giordano, Vice  
Chair  
AZPOST

Christine Shipley,  
Secretary  
Multihousing  
Association

Valerie Beckett  
County Administrator  
Maricopa County



STATE OF ARIZONA

## CONSTABLE ETHICS, STANDARDS AND TRAINING BOARD

PO Box 13116 Phoenix, AZ 85002  
cestb.az.gov

cestb@azcapitolconsulting.com

602-343-6280

FAX 602-712-1252

Mahogany Kennedy,  
Constable  
Maricopa County

Michael Hoggard  
Constable  
Mohave County

Melissa Buckley  
Public Member

### Minutes of Public Meeting – January 12, 2022

A public telephonic meeting of the Constables Ethics, Standards and Training Board (CESTB) was convened on January 12, 2023 at 9:02 a.m. CESTB Board members in attendance: Chairman Dennis Dowling, Vice Chair Matt Giordano, Secretary Christine Shipley, Constable Michael Hoggard, Constable Mahogany Kennedy and Valerie Beckett. CESTB Board members absent: Melissa Buckley. The following staff was present – Tracy Unmacht and Investigator Steve Jacobs. Members of the public attending – Patrice Goodman, Scott Davis, and Constable Nathan Wallace.

A quorum was reached, and the following matters were discussed and decided at the meeting:

#### **Announcements:**

Chairman Dowling announced the physical office has moved and future meetings will take place at the new location. Dowling also reported he made a presentation to new constables at their January training event introducing them to the CESTB.

#### **Minutes of Previous Meetings:**

Corrections: None

Constable Hoggard made a motion to approve the December 8, 2022 meeting minutes as presented and Constable Kennedy seconded. The motion passed 5-0 with Chairman Dowling abstaining.

#### **Call to the Public:**

None

**Financial Report:** Staff reviewed the November financial report received from Central Services Bureau. Staff reported adjustments were made for 80/20 revenue splits during this fiscal year. Revenue is up over expectations by an average of \$7600 per month through November. Staff clarified expected expenditures for investigator listed in the adjustments column on the cash flow projections report is the total amount budgeted less amounts already paid through January 1. Constable Hoggard made a motion to approve the November financial report and Constable Kennedy seconded. The motion passed unanimously 5-0 with Chairman Dowling abstaining.

#### **Discussion & Possible Action on Budget Increase for Investigations**

Staff reviewed the budget that was revised in November pointing out where funds are available within the current budget to potentially increase funding for investigations. Constable Hoggard made a motion to increase the budget for investigations by \$20,000 and Vice Chair Giordano seconded. The the motion passed with a roll call vote 5-0 with Chairman Dowling abstaining.

#### **Discussion & Possible Action on Constable Complaints:**

Chairman Dowling reported Constable Doug Clark has submitted his resignation, however the following open

complaint investigations are awaiting additional evidence from outside agencies from which Mr. Jacobs will make a final report, so these complaints will be reviewed at a future meeting:

1. CNA302-2023 William Rucker v Constable Doug Clark
2. CNA307-2023 William Rucker v Constable Doug Clark
3. CNA312-2023 William Rucker v Constable Doug Clark
4. CNA317-2023 William Rucker v Constable Doug Clark
5. CNA319-2023 William Rucker v Constable Doug Clark
6. CNA320-2023 William Rucker v Constable Doug Clark
7. CNA321-2023 William Rucker v Constable Doug Clark
8. CNA324-2023 William Rucker v Constable Doug Clark

The Chairman pointed out that with the Constable's resignation, there would no longer be jurisdiction for the board to pursue action, however, for future reference and possible training matters, it is prudent to complete the investigation prior to closing.

CNA305-2023 Nathan Wallace v Constable Doug Clark update on probation/request for resignation  
Constable Clark has resigned from office leaving no jurisdiction to take further action.

CNA306-2023 Constable Ron Williams v Constable Mike Harris - update on probation  
Constable Harris has resigned from office leaving no jurisdiction to take further action.

CNA308-2023 William Rucker v Constable Carolyn Lane  
Constable Lane has retired from office leaving no jurisdiction to take further action.

CNA311-2023 Iva Shaffer v Constable Ruben Mancha  
This complaint was forwarded the Gila County Attorney for criminal review in December. We have not received any response to date. Chairman Dowling indicated this will be reviewed again in several months, or at the time the county provides any information.

CNA304-2023 & CNA309-2023 William Rucker v Deputy Constable Steve Perkins  
These complaints are still awaiting additional evidence from outside agencies and will be reviewed at a future meeting.

CNA313-2023 Courtney White v Constable Bridget Bellavigna  
This complaint investigation was continued at the previous board meeting pending receipt of further information from the complainant. The investigator reported he received no response to his requests to the complainant. Constable Hoggard made a motion to dismiss the complaint and Christine Shipley seconded. After no further discussion, the motion passed with a roll call vote 5-0 with Chairman Dowling abstaining.

**Initial Screening of new Constable Complaints:**

Chairman Dowling reminded board members that during initial screening, opening an investigation into any complaint requires only one board member requesting to do so. Dismissal without investigation requires unanimous approval.

CNA325-2023 Adrienne Pineda v Deputy Constable Ramsen Isaac  
The complaint and initial review report from the investigator were circulated to the board prior to the meeting. Vice Chair Giordano requested this complaint be moved forward with an investigation into the matter. No second is required, and a roll call was taken resulting in unanimous agreement.

**Discussion & Possible Action on Rules Review & Update:**

Vice Chair Giordano reported he would have something to present at the February meeting.

**Administrative Update:**

Staff reported there are a handful of constables who have not yet submitted proof of meeting the required training for 2022. Staff will determine if any of those non-compliant have left office and will report at the February meeting any active constables that did not meet the requirements.

Staff reported there are no open public records requests.

Other than those complaints already discussed today, open complaints that are scheduled for the February meeting include CNA322-2023 Flick v Vasquez.

Application deadline for Equipment and Outside Training Grant Cycles is noon on January 30, 2023. Any applications received will be reviewed for funding at the February meeting.

Staff announced the office move has completed and future meetings will be held at the new location 1415 N 7<sup>th</sup> Ave in Phoenix.

**Future Agenda and Action Items:** None

**Adjournment:** Constable Hoggard made a motion to adjourn the meeting and Christine Shipley seconded. The motion passed unanimously. Meeting was adjourned at 9:32 a.m.

Dated this 9<sup>th</sup> day of February, 2023  
Constable Ethics, Standards and Training Board

By Dennis Dowling

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'D. Dowling', with a stylized flourish at the end.

CESTB Chairman