

Dennis Dowling, Chair  
Justice Court  
Yavapai County

Michael Hoggard, Vice  
Chair  
Constable  
Mohave County

Christine Shipley,  
Secretary  
Multihousing Association



CONSTABLE ETHICS, STANDARDS AND TRAINING BOARD  
PO Box 13116 Phoenix, AZ 85002  
cestb.az.gov  
cestb@azcapitolconsulting.com  
602-343-6280  
FAX 602-712-1252

Valerie Beckett  
County Administrator  
Maricopa County

Mahogany Kennedy  
Constable  
Maricopa County

Matt Giordano,  
AZPOST

Vacant  
Public Member

A public meeting of the Constables Ethics, Standards and Training Board (CESTB) was convened on February 8, 2024 at 9:00 a.m. at the offices of Capitol Consulting 1415 N 7th Ave, Phoenix, AZ 85007. CESTB Board members attending in person: None. CESTB Board members attended via teleconference: Chairman Dowling, Valerie Beckett, Vice Chair Constable Michael Hoggard and Christine Shipley. Members absent: Matt Giordano and Constable Mahogany Kennedy. The following staff were present – Chandni Bhakta and Steve Jacobs.

### MINUTES

- A. Call to order and Roll Call** –CESTB Board members attending in person: None. CESTB Board members attended via teleconference: Chairman Dowling, Valerie Beckett, Matt Giordano, Vice Chair Constable Michael Hoggard and Christine Shipley. Members absent: Constable Mahogany Kennedy.
- B. Announcements:** Constable conference and JP conference attended and successful. Chairman Dowling gave thanks to those attended and participated.
- C. Possible Action to Approve Minutes of Previous Meetings** – Tabled item for next meeting
- D. Executive Session** pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3) for the purpose of discussion or consultation for legal advice with its attorney or attorneys regarding any identified item on this agenda. Executive Session being held for Molina v. Garibay, et al.
- E. Call to Public** – This is the time for the public to make oral comments to the Board in person; note that written statements submitted to the Board will not be read during the Call to the Public and will not be accepted as part of the meeting record. Also, members of the Board may not discuss items that are not already listed on the written agenda. Therefore, unless a comment relates only to an item already listed on the written agenda for that meeting, pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.01(H) the Board's ability to act on that public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter, responding to any criticism, or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date. Finally, please note that the total time allowed for public comments will be limited to two (2) minutes, so that the public meeting can be conducted as scheduled.  
**Constable Scott Blake spoke about the complaints for initial screening and relayed information on current status of constables of those known to him.**
- F. Presentation of Financial Report by Department of Administration**– First page shows 80/20 split; financial report for combined December and January report; claims shown with what has been paid and awaiting outgoing payment, cash flow starting balance approximately a little over \$782,000 beginning of fiscal year; adjustments are still pending; ending cash balance approximately a little over \$629,000.
- G. Board Elections** – Tabled item for next meeting
- H. Presentation, Discussion & Possible Action on Cycle XII February Equipment Grant for Vacancies Applications** – No applications received
- I. Presentation, Discussion & Possible Action on Cycle XIII: General Constable Equipment Applications**- Motion to approve all grants made by Vice Chair Hoggard. Second by Member Beckett. Roll call vote: Vice Chair Hoggard, Member Shipley, Member Beckett, Chairman Dowling; motion passes.
- J. Presentation, Discussion & Possible Action on Cycle XIV: Outside Training Applications** – no applications received
- K. Initial Screening of New Complaints:**

1. **CNA378-2024 CESTB v Paul Brisco** - move forward, continue through investigation
2. **CNA379-2024 CESTB v Armando Carrillo** – dismiss; no longer constable
3. **CNA380-2024 CESTB v Lydia Garcia** - dismiss; no longer constable
4. **CNA381-2024 CESTB v Edward Huerta** – move forward, continue through investigation
5. **CNA382-2024 CESTB v Dan Rodriguez**- dismiss
6. **CNA383-2024 CESTB v Oscar Vasquez** - move forward, continue through investigation

Roll call vote: Vice Chair Hoggard, Member Shipley, Member Beckett, Chairman Dowling; motion passes.

**L. Administrative Update** – Staff reached out to AG representative for review of compliance on the grant applications. Vice Chair Hoggard has been working with Procurement and bid to go out soon.

**M. Future Agenda and Action Items** - None

**N. Adjournment**

A copy of the agenda background material provided to the Board members (with the exception of material relating to possible Executive Sessions) is available for public inspection by submitting a public records request through our website <https://cestb.az.gov/>

Dated this 8<sup>th</sup> day of February 2024



By: Dennis Dowling, Chairman