

Dennis Dowling, Chair
Justice Court
Yavapai County

Michael Hoggard, Vice
Chair
Constable
Mohave County

Christine Shipley,
Secretary
Multihousing Association



CONSTABLE ETHICS, STANDARDS AND TRAINING BOARD
PO Box 13116 Phoenix, AZ 85002
cestb.az.gov
cestb@azcapitolconsulting.com
602-343-6280
FAX 602-712-1252

Valerie Beckett
County Administrator
Maricopa County

Mahogany Kennedy
Constable
Maricopa County

Matt Giordano,
AZPOST

Vacant
Public Member

A public meeting of the Constables Ethics, Standards and Training Board (CESTB) was convened on March 14, 2024 at 9:00 a.m. at the offices of Capitol Consulting 1415 N 7th Ave, Phoenix, AZ 85007. CESTB Board members attending in person: Constable Mahogany Kennedy. CESTB Board members attended via teleconference: Chairman Dowling, Valerie Beckett, Vice Chair Constable Michael Hoggard and Matt Giordano. Members absent: Christine Shipley. The following staff were present – Chandni Bhakta and Steve Jacobs.

MINUTES

- A. **Call to order and Roll Call** – CESTB Board members attending in person: Constable Mahogany Kennedy. CESTB Board members attended via teleconference: Chairman Dowling, Valerie Beckett, Vice Chair Constable Michael Hoggard and Matt Giordano. Members absent: Christine Shipley.
- B. **Announcements** – Christine Shipley has resigned effective April. AMA searching for replacement.
- C. **Possible Action to Approve Minutes of Previous Meetings** – January minutes approved. February minutes tabled.
- D. **Call to Public** – This is the time for the public to make oral comments to the Board in person; note that written statements submitted to the Board will not be read during the Call to the Public and will not be accepted as part of the meeting record. Also, members of the Board may not discuss items that are not already listed on the written agenda. Therefore, unless a comment relates only to an item already listed on the written agenda for that meeting, pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.01(H) the Board's ability to act on that public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter, responding to any criticism, or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date. Finally, please note that the total time allowed for public comments will be limited to two (2) minutes, so that the public meeting can be conducted as scheduled.
None.
- E. **Presentation of Financial Report by Department of Administration** – Financial report not available as report was received a day prior to meeting.
- F. **Board Elections** – Constable Kennedy opened nominations for Chair. Member Beckett nominated current Chairman Dowling to continue to serve. No other nominations for Chair received and unanimous vote approved. Member Beckett nominated current Vice Chair Hoggard to continue to serve. No other nominations for Vice Chair and unanimous vote approved. Member Beckett nominated Constable Kennedy for role of Secretary. No other nominations for Secretary and unanimous vote approved.
- G. **Legislative Update** – Tabled for next meeting.
- H. **Presentation, Discussion & Possible Action on Cycle XV: March Equipment for Vacancies Applications** – No Applications
- I. **Discussion & Possible Action on Constable Complaints** – Chairman Dowling
 - 1. **CNA348-2023 N. Martinez v R. Pearce** – Motion to refer to Maricopa County Attorney's Office and Presiding Judge made by Vice Chair Hoggard. Second by Member Giordano. Roll call vote: Vice Chair Hoggard, Member Beckett, Constable Kennedy, and Member Giordano. Abstain: Chairman Dowling.
 - 2. **CNA368-2024 Liu v Rhymes** – No quorum, tabled for next meeting.
 - 3. **CNA370-2024 Walton v Rhymes** - No quorum, tabled for next meeting.
 - 4. **CNA373-2024 Georges v Chism** – Pull from agenda, not ready for board review.

5. **CNA374-2024 Wallace v Palmer** – Motion to Dismiss made by Vice Chair Hoggard and second by Constable Kennedy. Amended motion by Chairman Dowling to include Item 6. Roll call vote: Vice Chair Hoggard, Member Beckett, Constable Kennedy, and Member Giordano. Abstain: Chairman Dowling.
6. **CNA375-2024 Wallace v Palmer** - Motion to Dismiss made by Vice Chair Hoggard and second by Constable Kennedy. Amended motion by Chairman Dowling to include Item 6. Roll call vote: Vice Chair Hoggard, Member Beckett, Constable Kennedy, and Member Giordano. Abstain: Chairman Dowling

Initial Screening of New Complaints:

1. **CNA376-2024 Edmondson v Rowland**
2. **CNA377-2024 Edmondson v Rowland**
3. **CNA384-2024 Lopez v Chism**
4. **CNA385-2024 Lopez v Kznarich**
5. **CNA386-2024 Lopez v Bernal**
6. **CNA387-2024 Schuster v Griep**
7. **CNA388-2024 Dasari v Palmer** – Dismiss; constable resigned
8. **CNA389-2024 Roberson v Palmer** – Dismiss; constable resigned
9. **CNA390-2024 Wallace v Vasquez**
10. **CNA392-2024 Pageler v Emfinger**
11. **CNA393-2024 Rue v Wallace**

Motion to move forward for items 1-6 and 9-11 made by Vice Chair Hoggard and seconded by Member Giordano. Roll call vote: Vice Chair Hoggard, Member Beckett, Constable Kennedy, and Member Giordano. Abstain: Chairman Dowling

- J. Administrative Update** –Staff explained the volume of files proved technical difficulties, thus, switching file share services for this meeting. Staff would like Board to consider establishing timeframes to allow Board members adequate time to review and staff to review, compile, and send materials in preparation for the meetings. Staff will meet with Chairman Dowling to discuss further and inform Board.
- K. Future Agenda and Action Items** – **Vice Chair Hoggard provided up date on** procurement status for management of the board that has gone out for bid, will be place agenda
- L. Adjournment** – Motion made by Constable Kennedy and second made by Vice Chair Hoggard.

A copy of the agenda background material provided to the Board members (with the exception of material relating to possible Executive Sessions) is available for public inspection by submitting a public records request through our website <https://cestb.az.gov/>

Dated this 11th day of March, 2024



By: Dennis Dowling, Chairman