

Dennis Dowling, Chair
Justice Court
Yavapai County

Michael Hoggard, Vice
Chair
Constable
Mohave County

Christine Shipley,
Multihousing Association



CONSTABLE ETHICS, STANDARDS AND TRAINING BOARD
PO Box 13116 Phoenix, AZ 85002
cestb.az.gov
cestb@azcapitolconsulting.com
602-343-6280
FAX 602-712-1252

Valerie Beckett
County Administrator
Maricopa County

Mahogany Kennedy
Secretary
Constable
Maricopa County

Matt Giordano,
AZPOST

Vacant
Public Member

A public meeting of the Constables Ethics, Standards and Training Board (CESTB) was convened on April 11, 2024 at 9:00 a.m. at the offices of Capitol Consulting 1415 N 7th Ave, Phoenix, AZ 85007. CESTB Board members attending in person: None. CESTB Board members attended via teleconference: Chairman Dowling, Valerie Beckett, Vice Chair Constable Michael Hoggard, Constable Mahogany Kennedy and Matt Giordano. Members absent: Christine Shipley.

MINUTES

- A. Call to order and Roll Call** – CESTB Board members attending in person: None. CESTB Board members attended via teleconference: Chairman Dowling, Valerie Beckett, Vice Chair Constable Michael Hoggard, Constable Mahogany Kennedy and Matt Giordano. Members absent: Christine Shipley.
- B. Announcements – None**
- C. Possible Action to Approve Minutes of Previous Meetings** – January and February minutes approved. Constable Kennedy motion to approve and Constable Hoggard second. Motion passes.
- D. Call to Public** – This is the time for the public to make oral comments to the Board in person; note that written statements submitted to the Board will not be read during the Call to the Public and will not be accepted as part of the meeting record. Also, members of the Board may not discuss items that are not already listed on the written agenda. Therefore, unless a comment relates only to an item already listed on the written agenda for that meeting, pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.01(H) the Board's ability to act on that public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter, responding to any criticism, or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date. Finally, please note that the total time allowed for public comments will be limited to two (2) minutes, so that the public meeting can be conducted as scheduled.
- Terry Johnson spoke regarding his case during call to the public.
- E. Presentation of Financial Report by Department of Administration**– Financial report shows the 80/20 split adjustments by CSB on page 1. On page 2, the expenditures are listed by month and page 3 shows specific expenditures for February and March which includes administrative, investigator costs, and FY 24 grant payments. Page 4 shows the beginning cash balance in July and projections are shown. The average cash flow per month is \$30, 818.82 and the Board had budgeted \$35,188 per month. Adjustments for administrative expenses include pending payments to investigator and rules writer; aid to organizations include pending grant payments. The projected ending cash balance is listed as well.
- F. Legislative Update** – Legislature is on break. The current bills regarding constables are: HB2103 which amends statute to include constables and deputy constables to receive traumatic event counseling and it is moving through the legislature; HB2580 states qualifications for elected officials and has several more steps before receiving final vote; SB1239 deputy appointment notification did not receive votes; HB2593 public records timeframe held in senate government and did not get a hearing; SB1739 regarding public meetings passed committee of the whole and still moving through the legislature.
- G. Presentation, Discussion & Possible Action on Cycle XV: April Equipment for Vacancies Applications** – No Applications
- H. Discussion & Possible Action on Constable Complaints** – Chairman Dowling
1. **CNA356-2024 Jessica Schaffer v Paul Brisco** – Motion to dismiss. Motion passes 5-0.
 2. **CNA357-2024 Terry Johnson v Tony Martineau** - Motion to dismiss. Motion passes 5-0.
 3. **CNA368-2024 Jo-Hua Liu v Bryon Rhymes** – Motion to refer to County Attorney's Office and initial probation for 6 months. Motion passes 4-0. Constable Kennedy abstains.
 4. **CNA370-2024 Chad Walton v Bryon Rhymes** - Motion to refer to County Attorney's Office and initial probation for 6 months. Motion passes 4-0. Constable Kennedy abstains.

5. **CNA378-2024 CESTB v Paul Brisco** – Motion for a letter of reprimand. Motion passes 5-0.
6. **CNA381-2024 CESTB v Edward Huerta** - Motion to dismiss. Motion passes 5-0.
7. **CNA383-2024 CESTB v Oscar Vasquez** - Motion to dismiss. Motion passes 5-0.

Initial Screening of New Complaints:

1. **CNA394-2024 D. Palmer v Keys:** Motion to Dismiss – Constable Hoggard and Constable Kennedy second. Motion passes.
2. **CNA395-2024 Francisco Lopez v Eric Krznarich**
3. **CNA396-2024 Francisco Lopez v William Lake-Wright**
4. **CNA397-2024 Francisco Lopez v Bennet Bernal**
Group motion to investigate item #2-#4: Approved.

Board Discussion to initiate investigation against Constable Lopez for failing to file a complaint when the incidents occurred. Motion to initiate investigation made by Chairman Dowling and second by Constable Hoggard. Motion passes.

- I. Administrative Update** – No administrative update. Chairman Dowling shared that new timelines are established to ensure there is enough time for Board members to review meeting materials as the Board has seen an increase in complaints.
- J. Future Agenda and Action Items** – Possibly add rules draft as a future agenda item.
- K. Adjournment** – Motion made by Constable Kennedy and second made by Vice Chair Hoggard.

A copy of the agenda background material provided to the Board members (with the exception of material relating to possible Executive Sessions) is available for public inspection by submitting a public records request through our website <https://cestb.az.gov/>

Dated this 11th day of April, 2024



By: Dennis Dowling, Chairman