

Dennis Dowling, Chair  
Justice Court  
Yavapai County

Michael Hoggard, Vice  
Chair  
Constable  
Mohave County

Vacant  
Multihousing Association



CONSTABLE ETHICS, STANDARDS AND TRAINING BOARD  
PO Box 13116 Phoenix, AZ 85002  
cestb.az.gov  
cestb@azcapitolconsulting.com  
602-343-6280  
FAX 602-712-1252

Valerie Beckett  
County Administrator  
Maricopa County

Mahogany Kennedy  
Secretary/Constable  
Maricopa County

Matt Giordano,  
AZPOST

Vacant  
Public Member

**Notice of Meeting & Agenda – May 9, 2024**

**NOTICE: PURSUANT TO ARS 13-3102, NO ATTENDEES MAY POSSESS FIREARMS OR OTHER WEAPONS,  
EXCEPT FOR PEACE OFFICERS**

A public meeting of the Constables Ethics, Standards and Training Board (CESTB) was convened on May 09, 2024 at 9:00 a.m. at the offices of Capitol Consulting 1415 N 7th Ave, Phoenix, AZ 85007. CESTB Board members attending in person: None. CESTB Board members attended via teleconference: Chairman Dowling, Valerie Beckett, Vice Chair Constable Michael Hoggard, Constable Mahogany Kennedy. Members absent: Matt Giordano

MINUTES

- A. **Call to order and Roll Call** – CESTB Board members attending in person: None. CESTB Board members attended via teleconference: Chairman Dowling, Valerie Beckett, Vice Chair Constable Michael Hoggard, Constable Mahogany Kennedy. Members absent: Matt Giordano
- B. **Announcements** - None
- C. **Possible Action to Approve Minutes of Previous Meetings** – April minutes approved unanimously.
- D. **Call to Public** – This is the time for the public to make oral comments to the Board in person; note that written statements submitted to the Board will not be read during the Call to the Public and will not be accepted as part of the meeting record. Also, members of the Board may not discuss items that are not already listed on the written agenda. Therefore, unless a comment relates only to an item already listed on the written agenda for that meeting, pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.01(H) the Board's ability to act on that public comment will be limited to directing staff to study the matter, responding to any criticism, or scheduling the matter for further consideration and decision at a later date. Finally, please note that the total time allowed for public comments will be limited to two (2) minutes, so that the public meeting can be conducted as scheduled.  
Alice Rue spoke regarding her case during the call to the public.
- E. **Presentation of Financial Report by Department of Administration**– tabled as report was not available in time for the meeting. Unanimous approved.
- F. **Budget Discussion** – Tabled – unanimous approved.
- G. **Discussion and Action on establishing FY25 Board meeting dates and grant cycles** – CESTB meeting days remain the second Thursday of each month. Grant cycles for FY25 are tabled until the financial report and budget numbers are up to date and available. Unanimous approved.
- H. **Approval of Purchase Order for additional funds**- Additional purchase order of \$10,000 for investigator costs. Unanimously approved.
- I. **Presentation, Discussion & Possible Action on Cycle XVII: May Equipment for Vacancies Applications** – None.
- J. **Presentation, Discussion & Possible Action on Cycle XVIII: Organizational Training (Summer Event) Applications** – ACA application approved unanimously.
- K. **Discussion & Possible Action on Constable Complaints** – Chairman Dowling
  1. **CNA373-2024 Georges v Chism**: Dismiss – approved unanimously.

2. **CNA376-2024 Edmonson v Rowland:** Letter of warning – approved unanimously.
3. **CNA377-2024 Edmonson v Rowland:** Letter of warning – approved unanimously.
4. **CNA384-2024 Lopez v Chism:** Dismiss – approved unanimously.
5. **CNA385-2024 Lopez v Krznarich:** Dismiss – approved unanimously.
6. **CNA386-2024 Lopez v Bernal:** Dismiss – approved unanimously.
7. **CNA387-2024 Shuster v Griep:** Letter of Admonishment, refer to County Attorney, and 60 day probation – approved unanimously.
8. **CNA390-2024 Wallace v Vasquez:** tabled – approved unanimously.
9. **CNA392-2024 Pageler v Emfinger:** Dismiss - approved unanimously.
10. **CNA393-2024 Rue v Wallace:** Dismiss - approved unanimously.

**Initial Screening of New Complaints:**

1. **CNA399-2024 Cammarano v Chism:** Moving forward for investigation.

**L. Administrative Update** – If there are any questions on grants as budget and end of fiscal year approached, participants were encouraged to reach out.

**M. Procurement Update** – Capital Consulting won contract bid and will continue to provide administrative services to the Board.

**N. Future Agenda and Action Items:** Rules update to be given by Constable Kennedy.

**O. Adjournment:** Vice Chair Hoggard motion and Constable Kennedy second – approved unanimously.

A copy of the agenda background material provided to the Board members (with the exception of material relating to possible Executive Sessions) is available for public inspection by submitting a public records request through our website <https://cestb.az.gov/>

Dated this 9<sup>th</sup> day of May, 2024



By: Dennis Dowling, Chairman