

Dennis Dowling,  
Chair  
Justice Court  
Yavapai County

Michael Hoggard,  
Vice Chair  
Constable  
Mohave County

Christine Shipley,  
Secretary  
Multihousing  
Association

Valerie Beckett  
County Administrator  
Maricopa County



E OF ARIZONA

CONSTABLE ETHICS, STANDARDS AND TRAINING BOARD  
PO Box 13116 Phoenix, AZ 85002  
cestb.az.gov

cestb@azcapitolconsulting.com  
602-343-6280  
FAX 602-712-1252

Mahogany Kennedy,  
Constable  
Maricopa County

Matt Giordano  
AZPOST

Vacant  
Public Member

## **Minutes of Public Meeting – November 09, 2023**

A public meeting of the Constables Ethics, Standards and Training Board (CESTB) was convened on November 09, 2023 at 9:16 a.m. at the offices of Capitol Consulting 1415 N 7<sup>th</sup> Ave, Phoenix, AZ 85007. CESTB Board members attending in person: none. CESTB Board members attended via teleconference: Chairman Dennis Dowling, Vice Chair Constable Michael Hoggard, Constable Mahogany Kennedy, Matt Giordano. Members absent: Christine Shipley and Valerie Beckett. CESTB Board Members present in person: None. The following staff were present – Chandni Bhakta and Steve Jacobs.

A quorum was reached, and the following matters were discussed and decided at the meeting:

**Announcements – None**

### **Minutes of Previous Meetings**

Corrections: None

Constable Kennedy made a motion to approve the October 2023 meeting minutes as presented and Constable Hoggard seconded. The motion passed.

### **Call to the Public**

No public member spoke to the Board at this meeting.

### **Financial Report**

Board is three months into new fiscal year with the average revenue being a little over \$28,000 which was less than budgeted amount. The ending cash value for this month is a little over \$414,000. FY23 80/20 adjustments were made but have not been made for this month yet. Constable Kennedy motioned to approve and Member Giordano seconded. Motion passes.

**Presentation, Discussion & Possible Action on Cycle VI November Equipment Grant for Vacancies Application**– No applications received.

**Presentation, Discussion & Possible Action on Cycle VIII November Organizational Training Grant Application**—The remaining matrix scores were received at the meeting and Member Giordano recused himself for this vote. Only one submission for this grant for ACA (Arizona Constable Association). Constable Kennedy motioned to approve and Member Dowling seconded the motion.

### **Discussion & Possible Action on Constable Complaints**

NOTE: All complaints, supporting documentation, constable responses, and reports from the investigator were circulated to the board prior to the meeting.

CNA346-2023 Brent Yosick v Glenn Morrison – Member Giordano states he had an opportunity to review all case materials and investigative summary; motioned to dismiss with no action. Constable Kennedy seconds the motion. Roll Call:

Constable Hoggard, Member Giordano, Member Dowling, Constable Kennedy. Motion passes 4-0.

CNA354-2024 Alisha Walters v James Rich – Member Giordano states he had an opportunity to review all case materials and investigative summary. Member Giordano explained the case appeared convoluted, but despite this, the constable acted in good faith and motioned to dismiss with no action. Member Dowling  
Roll Call: Constable Hoggard, Member Giordano, Member Dowling, Constable Kennedy. Motion passes 4-0.

### **Initial Screening of New Constable Complaints:**

NOTE: All complaints and initial review reports from the investigator were circulated to the board prior to the meeting.

The following cases were mass motioned to continue for further investigation (Motion to move all cases forward for further cases). Member Giordano motioned and Member Dowling seconded the motion. Motion passes.

1. CNA367-2024 Garce Howard v Oscar Vasquez
2. CNA368-2024 Jo-Hua Liu v Byron Rhymes
3. CNA369-2024 Mary Burk v Edward Carmen
4. CNA370-2024 Chad Walton v Byron Rhymes
5. CNA371-2024 Devon Galland v Denice Garcia
6. CNA372-2024 Devon Galland v Nathan Wallace

### **Presentation, Discussion & Possible Action on Procurement Process for Administrative Contracts:**

Constable Hoggard states he continues to work on the procurement process.

**Administrative Update:** Constable Kennedy provides the Board with an update on the rule review process. Constable Kennedy continues to work with the rule writer and will provide the Board with an update as soon as it is available. No additional updates.

**Future Agenda and Action Items:** None

**Adjournment:** Constable Kennedy made a motion to adjourn the meeting and Member Giordano seconds the motion. The motion passed unanimously. The meeting was adjourned at 0933.

Dated this 9<sup>th</sup> day of November 2023  
Constable Ethics, Standards and Training Board

By Dennis Dowling

CESTB Chairman