

Dennis Dowling,  
Chair  
Justice Court  
Yavapai County

Michael Hoggard,  
Vice Chair  
Constable  
Mohave County

Christine Shipley,  
Secretary  
Multihousing  
Association

Valerie Beckett  
County Administrator  
Maricopa County



CONSTABLE ETHICS, STANDARDS AND TRAINING BOARD  
PO Box 13116 Phoenix, AZ 85002  
cestb.az.gov

cestb@azcapitolconsulting.com  
602-343-6280  
FAX 602-712-1252

Mahogany Kennedy,  
Constable  
Maricopa County

Matt Giordano  
AZPOST

Vacant  
Public Member

## **Minutes of Public Meeting – December 14, 2023**

A public meeting of the Constables Ethics, Standards and Training Board (CESTB) was convened on December 14, 2023 at 9:00 a.m. at the offices of Capitol Consulting 1415 N 7<sup>th</sup> Ave, Phoenix, AZ 85007. CESTB Board members attending in person: none. CESTB Board members attended via teleconference: Vice Chair Constable Michael Hoggard, Constable Mahogany Kennedy, Valerie Beckett and Matt Giordano. Members absent: Christine Shipley. CESTB Board Members present in person: Chairman Dennis Dowling. The following staff were present – Chandni Bhakta and Steve Jacobs.

A quorum was reached, and the following matters were discussed and decided at the meeting:

**Announcements – None**

### **Minutes of Previous Meetings**

Corrections: None

Constable Kennedy motioned and second Member Beckett.

### **Call to the Public**

No public member spoke to the Board at this meeting.

### **Financial Report**

No financial report this month as Administrator needs to gather adjustment numbers from pending claims.

### **Discussion and Possible Action on ACA Training from July- Chairman Dowling**

The board direction and vote are needed to determine whether or not to count the ACA training from July towards the training hours required for constables. Chairman Dowling asked Member Giordano if the issue was due to the training application not being submitted prior to the scheduled training. Member Giordano stated yes, the training cannot be approved after it has been conducted – there needs to be enough time to allow for training approval. Chairman Dowling asked if the classes were different than last year's training and Public Member/ACA President Scott Blake answered there is not much of a different. Constable Blake stated the new constable training is different this year as they try to cover different topics. Chairman Dowling asked the board if there are any further questions. Constable Hoggard second the motion. Roll call vote 4-0 and motion passed.

### **Presentation, Discussion & Possible Action on Cycle IX December Equipment Grant for Vacancies Applications – No applications received.**

### **Presentation, Discussion & Possible Action on Cycle X Organizational Firearms Training Grant Applications – One application received from ACA President Scott Blake**

Chairman Dowling asked if there were any questions. Member Giordano asked ACA President Blake if the 16 constables includes the ones from Maricopa County and confirmed. Chairman Dowling asked why the increase for one more person and why the training is 70 hours. ACA President Blake answered the firearms training has changed from 50 hours to 70 hours. They will be doing 10 hour days. This is two extra days on the grant. You can get to most training facilities in 5 days. Because it is 7 days of training plus weekends, and constables

need lodging for those traveling from their respective counties. Member Beckett asked if the training has been approved by AZPOST. ACA President Blake stated yes, they are following the model for approval. Member Giordano asked about the increase in admin fee of \$400. ACA President Blake stated the training site had been moved to Kingman, AZ in Mohave County, so the costs have dropped significantly. Member Giordano stated concerns over the overall grant process whether to have the auditor general review the process. Chairman Dowling asked to review CESTB grant forms. Member Beckett motioned for approval and Constable Kennedy second. Roll call: 3-1-1 motion passed.

### **Discussion & Possible Action on Constable Complaints**

NOTE: All complaints, supporting documentation, constable responses, and reports from the investigator were circulated to the board prior to the meeting.

CNA345-2023 Crick v Curtis – Constable Hoggard discusses referral to the Apache County Attorney’s office. Motion moved by Chairman Dowling and second my Member Giordano.

CNA347-2023 Miller v Martinez – Constable Hoggard discusses referral to the Maricopa County Attorney’s office. Member Beckett discusses need for the board to take more action. Motion to place Constable Martinez on probation for 30 days and refer the matter to MCAO made by Member Beckett. Constable Kennedy second. Roll Call vote motion passed.

CNA360-2024 Lake-Wright v Vasquez – Constable Hoggard motioned for referral to Pima County Presiding Judge. Member Giordano seconded the motion. Chairman Dowling stated Constable Vasquez has been suspended before and moves to amend motion for letter to urge resignation and recommend to the Pima County Board of Supervisors for suspension without pay. Constable Hoggard seconds and Roll call vote passed.

The following cases were motioned for referral to Pima County Presiding Judge: CNA361-2021, CNA362-2024, CNA364-2024 and CNA365-2024. Motioned by Constable Hoggard and seconded by Member Giordano. Roll Call vote motion passed.

CNA366-2024 Williamson v Garcia – Constable Hoggard motions for dismissal and Constable Kennedy seconds. Roll call vote passed.

CNA363-2024 Krznarich v Vasquez – Same motion as CNA360-2024; Motion for letter to urge resignation and recommend to the Pima County Board of Supervisors for suspension without pay. Constable Hoggard motioned and Constable Kennedy second. Roll call vote passed.

### **Initial Screening of new Constable Complaints:**

NOTE: All complaints and initial review reports from the investigator were circulated to the board prior to the meeting.

The following cases were motioned to move forward with investigation by Constable Hoggard: CNA373-2024 and CNA374-2024. Roll call vote passed.

**Administrative Update:** No update.

**Future Agenda and Action Items:** Chairman Dowling stated if there are any questions or concerns to reach out to him. Constable Kennedy working on the rule review process and update board once available.

**Adjournment:** Constable Kennedy made a motion to adjourn the meeting and Constable Hoggard seconds the motion. The motion passed unanimously. The meeting was adjourned.

Dated this 15<sup>th</sup> day of December 2023  
Constable Ethics, Standards and Training Board

By Dennis Dowling

CESTB Chairman